Deliberative Democracy

Political Science 581
University of Notre Dame
Prof. Gerry Mackie
Spring 2004
=================================================================

PURPOSE
Voting and discussion are two essential aspects of democracy. Voting is a mathematical operation and lends itself easily to formalization; thus, the economic theories of democracy prominent in the discipline of political studies during the later 20th century concentrated exclusively on voting, the aggregation of individuals’ preferences. The economic theories tend to find that democracy is a poor substitute for the market, and urge that democracy be minimized. Until the 1990s, political studies neglected the deliberative aspect of democracy, the transformation of individuals’ preferences in public forums of discussion. Scholars seeking a richer descriptive and normative account of democracy were inspired initially by Habermas’s theory of communicative action to offer new deliberative theories of democracy.

The course presents a comprehensive survey of the deliberative democracy literature, from a friendly but skeptical perspective.

CONTACTS
My office is at 405 Decio Hall, tel. 631-7570, email gmackie@nd.edu. Office hours are Wednesday 10:00-11:30, Thursday 2:00-3:30, or by appointment. I encourage you to take advantage of the opportunity for office consultations.

ASSESSMENT
The assessment is intended to promote advanced academic skills. Attendance, preparation, participation in discussion, including critical analysis, creative synthesis, and novel application of ideas, count for 35% of the final mark.

The remaining 65% will be based on your final paper for the course. The paper can be any kind of analysis related to deliberative democracy, but consult with me about your topic, and your research and writing plans, well before the end of the semester (let’s say, no later than March 30). Write and prepare the paper exactly as if it were a submission to one of the relevant journals (listed below, or another one, upon consultation), including length, format, and bibliography requirements.

PERFORMANCE
Unjustified absences are not permitted. Justified absences must be notified in advance (excepting impossibility). Absences can effect the participation portion of the grade, and I reserve the right to lower the grade further for unusual absences.

The academic honor code fully applies, and no lapses are tolerated. All borrowings must be cited. Any doubts must be resolved by inquiry to the instructor. Ambiguities are construed against the violator.

I don’t expect any problems from the people in this course, but fairness requires that I state such expectations in advance.

REQUIRED TEXTS, AND ON RESERVE

- Amy Gutmann and Dennis Thompson, 1996, *Democracy and Disagreement*, Harvard UP.

Note: I ordered paperback, and if possible used, editions. In all cases we are reading only some chapters of the book, and you may be able to save money by consulting the library reserve copy.

READING PACKETS

Packets of readings (all material not in the required texts) will be available from the Copy Center, 301 O’Shaughnessy Hall, in two installments. The first installment is pending at the Copy Center.

SCHEDULE

Required readings are listed first, and bullet-pointed. This is followed by a list of further readings. There is absolutely no expectation to consult the further readings, they are provided as a convenience to those wishing to pursue a topic.

Jan 13  **Introduction**

• Jon Elster, The Market and the Forum, in Bohman and Rehg
• Benhabib, Toward a Deliberative Model of Democratic Legitimacy, in Benhabib 1996

FURTHER READING ON DEMOCRACY:

Jan 20 Nino
• Nino, Constitution of Deliberative Democracy, Chs. 1, 4, 5, 6

FURTHER READING:

Jan 27 Social Choice Theory
• Dryzek, Deliberative Democracy and Beyond, Ch. 2, Minimal Democracy? The Social Choice Critique.
• Mackie, All Men are Liars: Is Democracy Meaningless?, in Elster, Deliberative Democracy
• Mackie, Democracy Defended, selections.

FURTHER READING:

Feb 3 Rawls
• Rawls, Political Liberalism, Preface (xv-xxix)
• Rawls, The Idea of Public Reason, in Bohman and Rehg, pp. 93-130
• Dryzek, Deliberative Democracy and Beyond, Ch. 1, Liberal Democracy and the Critical Alternative
FURTHER READING:
Rawls-Habermas Debate
Habermas reprinted and revised in his Inclusion of the Other
Rawls reprinted and revised in his Political Liberalism (1996 paperback edition)

Feb 10 Habermas
  • Chambers, Discourse and Democratic Practices
  • Habermas, 1997, Popular Sovereignty and Procedure, in Bohman and Rehg.
  • Bayne, Democracy and the Rechtsstaat: Habermas’s Faktizitat und Geltung
  • Scheuerman, Between Radicalism and Resignation: Democratic Theory in Habermas’s Between Facts and Norms

FURTHER READING:
Juergen Habermas, Popular Sovereignty as Procedure; in Bohman and Rehg 1997; and in Habermas, Between Facts and Norms.
Juergen Habermas, 1989, The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere, MIT Press.

Feb 17 Deliberation and Democratic Legitimacy
• Cohen, Deliberation and Democratic Legitimacy, in Bohman and Rehg
• Cohen, Procedure and Substance in Deliberative Democracy, in Bohman and Rehg

FURTHER READING:

Feb 24 Christiano, Weithman, Estlund
• Christiano, The Significance of Public Deliberation, in Bohman and Rehg
• David Estlund, Beyond Fairness and Deliberation: The Epistemic Dimension of Democratic Authority, in Bohman and Rehg

Mar 2 Gutmann and Thompson
• Gutmann and Thompson, Democracy and Disagreement, Chs. 1, 2, 6, Conclusion

FURTHER READING:

--Spring Break—

Mar 16 Bohman
• Bohman, Public Deliberation, Introduction, Chs. 1, 2, pp. 182-187

Mar 23 Against Deliberation I
• Ian Shapiro, 1999, Enough of Deliberation: Politics is about Interests and Power, in Macedo, Deliberative Politics.
• Mouffe, 2000, For an Agonistic Model of Democracy, in her The Democratic Paradox, Verso.

FURTHER READING:
Jodi Dean, 2001, Publicity and Deliberation: Democratic Ideals in Pursuit: Publicity’s Secret, Political Theory 29:624-651
Dana Villa, Postmodernism and the Public Sphere, APSR 86:712-721.

Mar 30 Young
- Young, Inclusion and Democracy, Introduction, 1, 2, 3

FURTHER READING:
Dryzek, Deliberative Democracy and Beyond, Ch. 3, Difference Democracy: The Consciousness-Raising Group against the Gentleman’s Club. Survey of difference democracy.
Lorenzo Simpson, 2000, Communication and the Politics of Difference: Reading Iris Young, Constellations 7:430-442. Criticism of Young on deliberation.
See readings listed under “Multiculturalism.”

Apr 6 Against Deliberation, II

FURTHER READING:

Apr 13 **Richardson**
- Richardson, *Democratic Autonomy*, Chs. 4, 5, 7, 10, 11, 12, 15

Apr 20 **Applications**
- Bruce Ackerman and James Fishkin, 2002, Deliberation Day, *Journal of Political Philosophy*

FURTHER READING:
Archon Fung, [www.archonfung.net/class/pal218.html](http://www.archonfung.net/class/pal218.html), Course Syllabus for Designing Democratic Innovation.
Michael Neblo, Deliberate Counting Voices in an Echo Chamber: Cognition, Complexity, and the Prospects for Deliberative Democracy, [www.src.uchicago.edu/politicaltheory/neblo00.pdf](http://www.src.uchicago.edu/politicaltheory/neblo00.pdf)

Apr 27 **Controversies**
- Goodin, Democratic Deliberation Within, *Philosophy and Public Affairs*
FURTHER READING:

OTHER USEFUL BOOKS, ON RESERVE
Seyla Benhabib, ed., 1996, Democracy and Difference: Contesting the Boundaries of the Political, Princeton UP. Important early anthology on deliberative democracy and difference democracy.
Maurizio Passerin d'Entreves, ed., 2002, Democracy as Public Deliberation, Manchester UP.
James Fishkin and Peter Laslett, eds., 2003, Debating Deliberative Democracy, Blackwell. Many of these essays are available in online journals; inquire.
Gerald Gaus, 2003, Contemporary Theories of Liberalism, Sage Publications. Excellent survey of contemporary liberal and democratic theory.
Gerry Mackie, 2003, Democracy Defended, Cambridge UP. Contra social choice theory. See also specific categories below.

SURVEY ARTICLES ON DELIBERATIVE DEMOCRACY
Recommended in order listed. Might make more sense later on in the course. Except for Warren, each of these is available electronically from the library.
OTHER COURSE SYLLABI ON DELIBERATIVE DEMOCRACY
Simone Chambers: www.chass.utoronto.ca/~schamber, Reason, Deliberation and the Public Sphere. Theoretical.

JOURNALS
Articles on deliberative democracy appear especially in Constellations (more continental) and in Journal of Political Philosophy (more Anglo-American); somewhat in Political Theory, Philosophy and Public Affairs, Philosophy and Social Criticism, Social Philosophy and Policy, American Political Science Review, Polity, and elsewhere.

POLITICAL THEORY LINKS
political theory digests
http://www.politicaltheory.info/ HOT
http://www.politicalthought.com
http://www.politicaltheory.blogspot.com/
http://www.bostonreview.net/ndf.html

social and political philosophy bibliography, comprehensive
http://www.sussex.ac.uk/Users/sefd0/bib/polphil.htm

humanities digest
http://www.aldaily.com/

philosophy links
http://www.epistemelinks.com/

organizations
http://www.political-theory.org/
http://www.cspt.tulane.edu/
http://organizations.oneonta.edu/apt/
http://poltheory.uchicago.edu/asplp.html

chicago
http://ptw.uchicago.edu/
http://home.uchicago.edu/~pmarkell/cpt.html
http://cptgrad.uchicago.edu/

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY ON ADDITIONAL TOPICS IS INCLUDED IN THE ELECTRONIC VERSION OF THE SYLLABUS EMAILED TO CLASS MEMBERS.
ADDITIONAL TOPICS

Dryzek
As above, and:

Mansbridge
Jane Mansbridge, 1993, Self-Interest and Political Transformation, in Marcus and Hanson, *Reconsidering the Democratic Public*.

FURTHER READING:

Sunstein
Other work, not in bibliography: Sunstein is a major legal theorist who offered an early and well-developed deliberative theory, perhaps somewhat paternalistic. See also Frank Michelman, another legal theorist in the “republican revival.”

Warren
Mark Warren, 1992, Democratic Theory and Self-Transformation, APSR 86:8-23

FURTHER READING:
Civil Society
Habermas, *Between Facts and Norms*, Ch. 7, Civil Society and the Political Public Sphere
Young, *Inclusion and Democracy*, Ch. 5, Civil Society and its Limits
Dryzek, *Deliberative Democracy and Beyond*, Ch. 4, Insurgent Democracy: Civil Society and State.
Much more. Inquire.

Consensus
Stuart Hampshire
Douglas W. Rae, 1975, The Limits of Consensual Decision, *APSR*, 79:1270-1297
Thoroughgoing critique of Habermasian consensus.
Cass Sunstein, DATE, Incompletely Theorized Agreements, CITE

Deliberative Polling

Green Theory
Dryzek, *Deliberative Democracy and Beyond*, Ch. 5, Green Democracy.

International Politics
Dryzek, *Deliberative Democracy and Beyond*, Ch. 5, Transnational Democracy and Beyond.
Dennis Thompson, *Journal of Political Philosophy*.
Young, *Inclusion and Democracy*, Ch. 7, Self-Determination and Global Democracy

**International Politics – European Union**

**Multiculturalism**
Iris Marion Young, *Democracy and Inclusion; Justice and the Politics of Difference*.

**Policy Analysis and Practice**

**Political Communication**
This is the label for the earlier behavoiralist study of communication in politics. Much of it does not bear on DD, but it’s worth a look. See John Gastil’s detailed syllabus for many cites in this literature, some directly on DD. Otherwise, the research of Huckfeldt and Sprague into networks of political communication seems relevant:


**Representation**


Young, *Inclusion and Democracy*, Ch. 4, Representation and Social Perspective.

**Social Psychology**

Not directly on deliberative democracy, but these review articles on the social-psychology of attitude change suggest novel lines of inquiry.


**Miscellaneous**

Anne Aaken, Christian List, and Luetge, eds., 2003, *Deliberation and Decision: Constitutional Theory and Deliberative Democracy*, Ashgate. I have not seen this volume, probably much formal theory.


Gerald Gaus, 1996, Justificatory Liberalism, Oxford UP.


Helen Schwartzman, 1989, The Meeting: Gatherings in Organizations and Communities, Plenum. Anthropology of meetings, USA.


-- END --